David,

I took a quick look and have a few comments in deck in red font. Let me know if you have any questions.

Also, add page numbers and “Monsanto Company Confidential” to slide deck.

Bill

From: SALTMIRAS, DAVID A [AG/1000]
Sent: Wednesday, December 08, 2010 11:17 AM
To: HEYDENS, WILLIAM F [AG/1000]
Subject: Updated glyphosate activities presentation for Friday's CPTLT meeting

Bill,

Updated and attached for your comment.

Thanks,

David Saltmiras, Ph.D., D.A.B.T.
Toxicology Manager
Regulatory Product Safety Center
Monsanto
ph

David Saltmiras, Ph.D., D.A.B.T.
Toxicology Manager
Regulatory Product Safety Center
Monsanto
ph
Glyphosate Toxicology
Activities
Supporting Registration Reviews

David Saltmiras, PhD, DABT
CPTLT December 10, 2010
Overview

- Pending glyphosate regulatory reviews
- Expert engagement
- Testing – voluntary and mandatory
- Publications – positioning ourselves with strong science against emotive research and politically pressured regulatory reviews
- Political Science
Glyphosate Registration/ADI Reviews

- EU Annex I Renewal
  - May 2012 dossier submission
- US EPA / Canada PMRA Registration Review
  - DCIs issued
- Japan ADI review
  - On hold - Ongoing
  - MON data ADI = 0.75 mg/kg/day; Syngenta’s = 1 mg/kg/day
- Brazil – formulation registrations & ADI review.....
- Regulators are increasingly more concerned with allegations arising in peer reviewed literature
- More balanced peer reviewed publications are needed to place poor science in context
EU Expert Panel

- EU Expert Panel established in mid 1990’s to provide guidance from recognized experts in toxicology, pathology and epidemiology
- Recommended voluntary glyphosate testing strategies and scientific publications to support glyphosate regulatory reviews/ approvals and freedom to operate
- Funding to maintain a similar South American network of experts was withdrawn earlier this decade
EU Expert Panel Recommendation 1

Affirmed MON Study Proposal

- Evaluation of rat salivary gland hypertrophy
  - Arguably a driver in EU endpoint selection, ADI 0.3 mg/kg/day
  - Driver in JMPR (2004) endpoint selection, ADI 1.0 mg/kg/day
  - Hypothesis of local oral irritation due to an organic acid in diets causes an adaptive response in rodents
- 8-week rat study
  - Dietary citric acid (low pH), sodium citrate (high pH) and gavage citric acid (bypassing oral cavity) Vs diet and gavage controls
Salivary Gland Study Results

- Statistically significant increase in parotid salivary gland weight in the low pH diet group
- Cytoplasmic alteration in the parotid salivary glands was most severe in the low pH diet group
- Considered an adaptive response rather than an adverse effect
- Future publication planned
- Opens opportunity to argue for increased glyphosate ADI in the European Union Again
EU Expert Panel Recommendation 2

- Context of two *In vitro* publications by the Seralini group
  - Gasnier et al. (2009), *Glyphosate-based herbicides are toxic and endocrine disruptors in human cell lines*
  - Benachour et al. (2009), *Glyphosate Formulations Induce Apoptosis and Necrosis in Human Umbilical, Embryonic, and Placental Cells*
- Professor [Name], Uni. of Birmingham, UK
- Comparison of R400 and R400 formulation blank cytotoxicity to that of widely used generic detergents
  - Sodium dodecyl sulphate (SDS) – anionic detergent
  - Benzalkonium chloride (BC) – cationic detergent
  - Biosoft N-25 – non-ionic detergent
**In Vitro Cytotoxicity Findings**

- R400 and R400 blank have very similar toxicity profiles
  - Seralini assertion of “enhanced” glyphosate toxicity from surfactants is debunked; no synergistic effects
- Seralini R400 cytotoxicity data are repeatable
- Cell lines tested perform fairly similarly – suggests a non specific effect
- Rank order of cytotoxic potency
  - BC (cationic) > Biosoft (non-ionic) > SDS (anionic) ~ R400 = R400 blank
- Evidence that serum is protective as expected
  - Seralini stressed the *in vitro* systems with absence of serum
- Future publication(s) planned
Immunotoxicity – US EPA Data Call In
  - In life complete and no issues
  - Immunoassay results due next week
  - US EPA Program
  - Test Orders: 11 “Screening” assays @ $1,000,000
  - OSRI Review: likely EPA rejection by end 2010
    - Head of retiring this year
    - Talk of industry law suit through the Endocrine Policy Forum
  - Coordinate testing through JGTF ToxTWG
Publications

- Williams et al. (2000) an invaluable asset
  - Monsanto responses to agencies
  - Scientific Affairs rebuttals
  - Regulator reviews
- More current external expert publications are now needed to support our FTO and Registration Reviews
  - EU Annex 1 Renewal requires extensive lit. review
  - Will weight of evidence be measured by number of publications or quality of the science???
Third Party White Papers

- Often critique methodology, interpretation of data and context of findings
- Kept in “back pocket”
- Response to Romano et al. (2010) *Prepubertal exposure to commercial formulation of the herbicide glyphosate alters testosterone levels and testicular morphology*
  - Exponent: Bill Kelce, Jim Lamb and John DeSesso
- Response to Bolognesi et al. (2009) *Biomonitoring of Genotoxic Risk in Agricultural Workers from Five Colombian Regions: Association to Occupational Exposure to Glyphosate*
  - Larry Kier
Publications in the works

- Letter to the Editor of Chemical Research in Toxicology
  - Carrasco publication; Paganelli et al. (2010) *Glyphosate-Based Herbicides Produce Teratogenic Effects on Vertebrates by Impairing Retinoic Acid Signaling*
  - Currently undergoing internal Monsanto review
  - HARC Letter to Editor addressing industry data integrity
- Jack Mandel – epidemiology cancer endpoints currently in peer review
- Jack Mandel – epidemiology non-cancer endpoints
- John DeSesso – reproductive and developmental toxicity and endocrine disruption, final Monsanto review next week
- Adaptive responses of the salivary glands to an acidic diet. Eurotox presentation and manuscript for publication
Proposed Publications – funding?

- independent review of Agricultural Health Study (epidemiology) for rebuttals to claimed associations of health effects with glyphosate exposure
- Epidemiology methods paper – to provide a concise reference for critique of poor epidemiological methods
- in vitro cytotoxicity evaluations of surfactants. Eurotox presentation and manuscript for publication
Proposed Publications cont.

- Larry Kier – Glyphosate genetox overview (post-2000)
  - Note: is on the EFSA Scientific Panel on Plant Protection products and their Residues (PPR Panel)
  - The Panel works closely with the Pesticide Risk Assessment Peer Review (PRAPeR) which is responsible for the EU-peer review of active substances used in new or existing plant protection products.
  - \textit{in vitro} exposures and the relevance to human health risk assessment. Evaluating published doses Vs human serum levels
  - Dietary exposure assessment for European regions
Political Science

- Unfortunately, we are facing regulatory reviews with increased focus on
  - Claims in the peer reviewed literature, irrespective of the quality of the science
  - Stakeholder input including activist researchers
  - Political pressure on outcomes – e.g. POEAs in Germany
  - Reduced pesticide use in general
- Williams et al. (2000) has served us well in toxicology over the last decade
- We need a stronger arsenal of robust scientific papers to support the safe use of our products as we face the next set of chemistry registration reviews across the globe
- With increasing business interests in South America, a local network credible expert scientists is crucial to facilitate scientifically robust and objective regulatory evaluations of our products

*We have not determined exactly what we should & could do here. I would modify bullet to reflect that we need to determine an appropriate & do-able (i.e., we can get someone to pay for it) course of action here*